PROTECTING PEOPLE AND THE PLANET

July 15, 2020

#### Via ECF

Hon. Roanne L. Mann Chief Magistrate Judge United States District Court For the Eastern District of New York 225 Cadman Plaza East Brooklyn, New York 11201

Re: Joint Status Update; Suffolk County Water Authority v. The Dow Chemical Company et al., No. 2:17-cv-6980-NG-RLM, and Related Cases

#### Dear Judge Mann:

On behalf of all 32 parties in the referenced cases, we write to provide this joint status report in advance of the conference currently scheduled with the Court on July 22, 2020.

The parties have worked efficiently and cooperatively to make progress on discovery despite the challenges and delays COVID-19 and its related closures have presented. The following activities have been completed since our last report:

- 1. The parties have served additional and supplemental responses and document productions in connection with their initial Fact Sheet responses. They continue to work cooperatively on these issues and have no disputes that require the Court's assistance at this time.
- 2. On July 1, 2020, each of the 27 Plaintiffs and 5 Defendants exchanged responses and objections to their initial written discovery demands and commenced the rolling production of documents. The parties are in the process of reviewing and analyzing these voluminous materials to determine what meet and confer discussions may be needed. As the parties have agreed to rolling productions, additional documents will be produced. At the present time, the parties do not have any disputes that require the Court's guidance.
- 3. The parties have served a total of 31 third-party subpoenas and Freedom of Information requests: (1) the parties jointly served six subpoenas and two Freedom of Information requests; (2) Plaintiffs served 19 subpoenas; and (3) Defendants served four subpoenas. With limited exception, these third parties have made contact with the parties and have made initial document productions and/or provided written responses, or they have indicated that they need additional time to respond because of COVID-related closures—indeed, 20 of the 31 third parties have not produced any documents yet. As could be

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> By agreement, Defendants Shell and P&G intend to begin their rolling productions on or before July 31, 2020. The parties have agreed to an initial set of search terms for P&G to apply to its ESI and continue to confer regarding the search terms to be employed by Shell.

Hon. Roanne L. Mann July 15, 2020 Page 2

expected, COVID-related issues have affected the degree of success the parties have experienced in receiving third-party document productions, but the parties are continuing to be as flexible as possible with third-party response times and production issues. The parties will report to the Court at the next status conference, or sooner, if warranted, regarding any disputes concerning particular third-party subpoenas and FOIL requests.

- 4. At this time, there is only one third-party dispute that may require assistance from the Court. That dispute involves the heightened confidentiality restrictions the New York Department of Environmental Conservation (DEC) and the New York Department of Health (DOH) have sought from the parties prior to producing certain categories of well data. Discussions with the DEC and DOH on this request have been difficult to schedule because of those agencies' reported COVID-related activities. Despite this, the parties remain in discussions with the DEC and DOH and are hopeful they can reach agreement. If not, they may seek the Court's assistance.
- 5. On July 21, 2020, Defendants The Dow Chemical Company, Ferro Corporation and Legacy Vulcan, LLC will answer the Complaints in the cases that were the subject of the three Defendants' motions to dismiss, which Judge Gershon denied on June 4, 2020.
- 6. Defendants Procter & Gamble and Shell Oil's motions to dismiss Hicksville Water District's and New York American Water's complaints were fully briefed in February 2020 and a decision is still pending.

Based on the above progress, the parties propose that they provide their next joint status report to the Court in three months. By that time, the parties should have a better idea as to the scope of remaining document discovery and will be in a better position to discuss next steps. If discovery issues arise that require the Court's assistance before then, they will follow the Court's Rules to seek a prompt resolution.

Finally, while the parties are prepared to proceed with the July 22 conference as scheduled, they do not have any issues currently requiring the Court's guidance. Accordingly, the parties respectfully propose that the Court set a new conference date for approximately three months from now. If the Court prefers to move forward with the July 22 conference, the parties request that the conference be conducted telephonically or through other remote means, due to the number of attorneys involved and COVID-related travel issues.

We thank the Court for its consideration and hope that all Court personnel are safe and well.

Respectfully submitted,

MATTHEW K. EDLING matt@sheredling.com

# Case 2:17-cv-06980-NG-RLM Document 153 Filed 07/15/20 Page 3 of 4 PageID #: 1206

Hon. Roanne L. Mann July 15, 2020 Page 3

VICTOR M. SHER vic@sheredling.com STEPHANIE D. BIEHL stephanie@sheredling.com KATIE H. JONES katie@sheredling.com NICOLE TEIXEIRA nicole@sheredling.com

SHER EDLING LLP

100 Montgomery St. Suite 1410 San Francisco, CA 94104 (628) 231-2500

Attorneys for Plaintiffs<sup>2</sup>

SCOTT MARTIN smartin@hausfeld.com JEANETTE BAYOUMI jbayoumi@hausfeld.com **HAUSFELD LLP** 33 Whitehall St., 14th Floor New York, NY 10004 (646) 357-1100

rlewis@hausfeld.com **HAUSFELD LLP**1700 K Street, NW, Suite 650
Washington, DC 20006
(202) 540-7200

KATIE R. BERAN kberan@hausfeld.com HAUSFELD LLP

RICHARD S. LEWIS

325 Chestnut Street, Suite 900 Philadelphia, PA 19106 (215) 985-3270

Attorneys for Plaintiff Suffolk County Water Authority

<sup>2</sup> The Sher Edling firm represents all Plaintiffs in these related cases except Plaintiffs New York American Water (19-cv-2150) and Hicksville Water District (19-cv-5632).

FRANK R. SCHIRRIPA
fschirripa@hrsclaw.com
MICHAEL A. ROSE
mr@hachroselaw.com
HILLARY M. NAPPI
hnappi@hrsclaw.com
HACH ROSE SCHIRRIPA &
CHEVERIE, LLP
112 Madison Avenue - 10th Floor

New York, New York 10016 (212) 213-8311 J. NIXON DANIEL, III

jnd@beggslane.com MARY JANE BASS mjb@beggslane.com BEGGS & LANE, RLLP 501 Commendencia Street Pensacola, FL 32502 850-469-3306

T. ROE FRAZER, II
roe@frazer.law
THOMAS ROE FRAZER, III
trey@frazer.law
W. MATTHEW PETTIT
mpettit@frazer.law
FRAZER PLC
30 Burton Hills Blvd., Suite 450
Nashville, TN 37215
615-647-0987

Attorneys for Plaintiff New York American Water Company, Inc.

PAUL J. NAPOLI pnapoli@napolilaw.com LILIA FACTOR lfactor@napolilaw.com NAPOLI SHKOLNIK PLLC 360 Lexington Avenue, 11th Floor New York, NY 10017 (212) 397-1000

Attorneys for Plaintiff Hicksville Water District

Hon. Roanne L. Mann July 15, 2020 Page 4

JOEL ALAN BLANCHET jblanchet@phillipslytle.com ANDREW P. DEVINE adevine@phillipslytle.com

# PHILLIPS LYTLE LLP

One Canalside 125 Main Street Buffalo, NY 14203 (716) 847-7050

KEVIN T. VAN WART kevinvanwart@kirkland.com NADER R. BOULOS nboulos@kirkland.com

### KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP

300 North LaSalle Chicago, IL 60654 (312) 862-2000

Attorneys for Defendant The Dow Chemical Company

ROBB W. PATRYK robb.patryk@hugheshubbard.com FARANAK SHARON TABATABAI fara.tabatabai@hugheshubbard.com **HUGHES HUBBARD & REED LLP** One Battery Park Plaza New York, NY 10004 (212) 837-6000

Attorneys for Defendant Ferro Corporation

STEPHEN C. DILLARD steve.dillard@nortonrosefulbright.com NORTON ROSE FULBRIGHT US LLP 1301 McKinney, Suite 5100 Houston, Texas 77010 (713) 651-5151

FELICE B. GALANT felice.galant@nortonrosefulbright.com FAROOQ A. TAYAB

All Counsel of Record (by ECF) cc:

farooq.tayab@nortonrosefulbright.com NORTON ROSE FULBRIGHT US LLP

1301 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10019 (212) 318-3000

Attorneys for Defendant Vulcan Materials Company

MEGAN R. BRILLAULT mbrillault@bdlaw.com DANIEL M. KRAININ dkrainin@bdlaw.com PAULA J. SCHAUWECKER pschauwecker@bdlaw.com **BEVERIDGE & DIAMOND P.C.** 

477 Madison Avenue 15th Floor New York, NY 10022 212-702-5400

Attorneys for Defendant Shell Oil Company

DAVID J. LENDER david.lender@weil.com JED PAUL WINER jed.winer@weil.com WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES, LLP 767 Fifth Avenue New York, NY 10153 212-310-8000

DIANE P. SULLIVAN diane.sullivan@weil.com RACHEL ANNE FARNSWORTH rachel.farnsworth@weil.com WEIL GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP 17 Hulfish Street, Suite 201 Princeton, NJ 08542 609-986-1120

Attorneys for Defendant The Procter & Gamble Company